



AMERICAN METEOROLOGICAL SOCIETY

Bulletin of the American Meteorological Society

EARLY ONLINE RELEASE

This is a preliminary PDF of the author-produced manuscript that has been peer-reviewed and accepted for publication. Since it is being posted so soon after acceptance, it has not yet been copyedited, formatted, or processed by AMS Publications. This preliminary version of the manuscript may be downloaded, distributed, and cited, but please be aware that there will be visual differences and possibly some content differences between this version and the final published version.

The DOI for this manuscript is doi: 10.1175/BAMS-D-17-0207.1

The final published version of this manuscript will replace the preliminary version at the above DOI once it is available.

If you would like to cite this EOR in a separate work, please use the following full citation:

Martius, O., A. Hering, M. Kunz, A. Manzato, S. Mohr, L. Nisi, and S. Trefalt, 2017: Challenges and recent Advances in Hail Research - A report from the 2nd European Hail Workshop. Bull. Amer. Meteor. Soc. doi:10.1175/BAMS-D-17-0207.1, in press.

© 2017 American Meteorological Society



Challenges and recent Advances in Hail Research – A report from the 2nd European Hail Workshop

Olivia Martius¹, A.Hering, M. Kunz, A.Manzato, S. Mohr, L.Nisi., S.Trefalt

¹ Corresponding author

Institute of Geography

Hallerstrasse 12

3012 Bern

Switzerland

+41316313337

Olivia.martius@giub.unibe.ch

Infobox

2nd European Hail Workshop

What: Severe hailstorms pose a significant threat to buildings, crops, and vehicles. At the same time, these storms are difficult to predict, model, and observe. About 130 representatives from the academic community, operational weather services, and the insurance industry met in Bern (Switzerland) for three days to discuss the current state of hail research and to identify key research gaps and future challenges.

When: 19 – 21 April 2017

Where: Bern (Switzerland)

22

23 *Introduction*

24 In several regions around the world, severe hailstorms frequently cause considerable damage
25 to buildings, agriculture, and vehicles, resulting in large economic and insured losses.
26 Estimating local-scale hail frequency, which is required e.g. for insurance risk models, or
27 assessing long-term trends in light of climate change are challenging tasks – particularly
28 because direct, homogeneous, long-term hail observations are mostly missing. At present,
29 numerical weather prediction (NWP) and nowcasting models often still fail to reliably predict
30 hailstorms, even at lead times of minutes to hours. This is due mainly to the microphysical
31 processes involved that are yet to be better understood, as well as to a lack of appropriate
32 atmospheric observations assimilated into these models. Alternative methods have been
33 developed that relate hail occurrence to proxies such as remote sensing observations from
34 radar, satellite, and lightning sensors or less conventional monitoring systems such as hail
35 reports from crowd-sourcing.

36 The scope of hail research presented at the 2nd European Hail Workshop spanned from basic
37 research on the dynamics and microphysics of hailstorms or past and future changes of hail
38 probability, to more applied research on hail forecasting, hail warnings, and hail loss
39 modeling. About 130 representatives from 27 countries from research institutions,
40 operational weather services, and insurance companies attended the workshop. The main
41 objectives of the workshop were to identify and discuss topics relevant for both basic and
42 applied researchers, to facilitate communication and data exchange among these groups, to
43 foster new collaborations, and to strengthen the international hail research community.

44 *Key topics and results*

45 The three-day workshop featured 37 talks (9 key note talks) and 20 poster presentations.
46 Podcasts of the presentations and PDF documents of the posters are available from the
47 workshop website

48 (http://www.oeschger.unibe.ch/services/events/conferences/past_conferences/2nd_european_hail_workshop/presentations/index_eng.html).
49

50 The workshop was organized in five thematic sessions:

- 51 1) Local probabilities and long-term statistics of hail
- 52 2) Convection and hail in a changing climate
- 53 3) Hail damage and hail damage prevention
- 54 4) Microphysics and dynamics of hailstorms: observations and modeling
- 55 5) Nowcasting and forecasting of hail

56 *Local probabilities and long-term statistics of hail*

57 The contributors to this session presented local-, regional-, and continental-scale hail
58 frequency estimates and analyses of hail-conducive atmospheric environments. Hail
59 occurrence statistics are based mainly on radar- or satellite-derived hail proxies (see Punge et
60 al. 2016 for an overview) and few Hailpad networks.

61 Radar-based statistics have a good accuracy thanks to the high spatio-temporal resolution of
62 radar measurements. The generation of composites encompassing large regions is difficult
63 because of the different characteristics of existing (mostly national) radar networks (S-, C-,
64 and X-band, single or dual-polarization). The presented statistics reveal a large spatial
65 variability of hail probability governed by both large-scale atmospheric conditions and local-

scale orography, the latter through its role in triggering convection. Satellite-based hail proxies (overshooting cloud tops, OT) are particularly promising when focusing on continental scales. For some regions, however, uncertainties are very large mainly because of the sometimes weak relation between hail on the ground and OT events. Furthermore, the OT approach misses or underestimates hail in thunderstorms with comparatively low and warm cloud tops. Global analyses reveal that hail occurs worldwide, both in the subtropics and extratropics, and single very large hailstones (above 10 cm) have been reported from many locations around the world. Such global overviews of hail occurrence allow the classification of the intensity and rarity of individual hailstorms in a global perspective.

A further approach to derive hail statistics is based on hail-favoring environments, i.e. atmospheric parameters statistically associated to hailstorm formation (e.g., atmospheric instability and low-level moisture content) in reanalysis data or atmospheric soundings. This method is simple to implement, generally robust given the long-term availability of data series, and has the potential to provide new insights into the drivers of the temporal variability of severe convection. Discussed limitations of this approach are i) the omitted information about the occurrence of thunderstorm triggers, as the method only allows an estimation of the atmospheric hail potential and not the true hail occurrence; ii) a strong dependence on the specific reanalysis product used (e.g., resolution, data assimilation); and (iii) the missing information on potentially small-scale spatial and short-term temporal variability of the atmospheric hail proxies.

To identify the most skillful environmental hail proxies and to calibrate radar- and satellite-based hail-identification algorithms, plausible ground observations are required. If no direct hail observations are available (e.g., Hailpad networks, automatic hail sensors), insurance

loss data or crowd-sourced data, such as that collected within by the European Severe Weather Database (Dotzek et al., 2009), are extremely valuable.

Convection and hail in a changing climate

Potential changes in hail frequency, intensity, and hailstone size distribution in a warmer climate are complex to assess. This is due to uncertainties regarding, e.g., the effect of increased freezing level heights or potentially stronger thunderstorm updrafts on hail size, but it is also due to uncertainties concerning the mean prevailing dynamical and thermodynamical conditions and the evolution of cloud microphysical processes with compounding effects of increasing/decreasing aerosol concentrations in the future.

Furthermore, analyses of hail frequency and/or intensity changes during recent decades also show large uncertainties, mainly because of the scarce availability of homogeneous long-term observations. In the limited areas with high-density Hailpad networks, such as parts of France, Northern Spain, Eastern Italy or China, the trends may be opposite: For example, decreasing trends were found in China and increasing trends in Spain. The differing trends are related to physical, microphysical, and dynamical effects such as changes in instability, changes in moisture advection, level of freezing, or changing aerosol concentrations. In addition, there have been changes in observation practice and changes in vulnerability and exposure of the insured objects, in case of insurance loss data.

Where no observations are available, environmental proxies from reanalyses or climate model simulations are often used to investigate temporal changes and variability of hail occurrence. While this approach does not consider storm triggers, it still enables a spatially quasi-homogenous long-term view. According to proxies extracted from an ensemble of EURO-CORDEX models, an increase of hail frequency is expected for future decades for parts of Europe.

113 A novel method to estimate the impact of climate change on convection is the so-called
114 “pseudo-global-warming” approach, where present-day hail events are simulated with a high-
115 resolution local area model both in current and future atmospheric environments. Results
116 based on this approach point to a higher frequency of large hail in the future over Switzerland
117 and the U.S., while at the same time hailstorms are shorter-lived and spatially less
118 widespread.

119 *Microphysics and dynamics of hailstorms: observations and modeling*

120 One of the open questions – relevant for both the present and a changing climate – pertains to
121 the effect of aerosols on ice secondary multiplication and hail formation. Model simulations
122 show contradicting results, and theory provides plausible explanations for both an increase
123 and decrease of hail with increasing aerosol concentrations. Large model sensitivities to the
124 integration time-step, lead time, and the microphysics schemes used are furthermore found.
125 For impact modeling and impact studies, the terminal velocity of hailstones (proportional to
126 the kinetic energy) and the hail size are relevant. The terminal velocity is very difficult to
127 estimate because it non-linearly depends on the density and shape of the hailstones, and
128 especially large hailstones are not spherical.

129 Hail size and related kinetic energy estimates are currently provided by specific hail models
130 such as the 1D HAILCAST cloud model. Simulations with the Weather Research and
131 Forecasting (WRF) model with HAILCAST module show promising results even in complex
132 topography. In the discussion of this session it was pointed out that the small number of
133 direct observations and laboratory experiments limits the development of sophisticated hail
134 parametrizations and hail models.

135 *Hail damage and hail damage prevention*

136 The development of catastrophe (CAT) models of insurance companies requires information
137 on hail hazard (i.e., hail probability and severity), vulnerability (i.e., damage of insured
138 objects as a function of hail size), and exposure (i.e., insured objects at a given location).
139 Typically, insurance companies estimate the hazard part by stochastically modeling
140 thousands of synthetic hailstreaks based on data from remote sensing instruments (satellite,
141 radar, lightning), or use data from regional climate models or reanalysis, or a combination
142 thereof. A large source of uncertainty is the lacking information about hailstone size
143 distributions. For some insurance applications, near real-time hail estimates of affected areas
144 and intensities, e.g. by radar-based hail nowcasting, is of high practical value.

145 *Nowcasting and forecasting of hail*

146 An optimal nowcasting system should combine information from all observing systems to
147 extend the forecasting lead time and to increase the accuracy. Accordingly, several efforts are
148 underway to improve nowcasting of hail using the real-time characteristics of thunderstorms
149 recorded by radar, satellite, and lightning. Satellite-based thunderstorm detection algorithms
150 typically capture thunderstorms several tens of minutes before the first radar observations,
151 but lack the level of detail provided by the latter, in particular if with dual-polarization
152 capabilities. During the lifecycle of hailstorms, lightning activity increases substantially, a
153 phenomenon referred to as ‘lightning jump’. Results, however, disagreed regarding the exact
154 timing of those features related to the onset of hail. These indicated either a nowcasting
155 relevant lead time for the first hail at the ground or for the maximum hail intensity. In
156 principle, nowcasting of hail is possible by combining lightning jump information and the
157 approximation of the future hailtrack. However, cell displacement estimate methods are yet
158 to become more precise to produce less uncertain results. Characteristic life-cycle
159 information of hailstorms (e.g., for how long they typically persist after hail first reaches the

ground) may add valuable information and should be incorporated into the nowcasting systems. With increasing implementation and coverage of dual-polarimetric radar networks that have the capability to identify hail through complex hydrometeor classifications, new hail detection methods become available.

Conclusions and next steps

A recurring issue discussed in all sessions of the workshop and relevant for a broad range of applications is the lack of reliable, high-quality, long-term observational data as well as laboratory experimental data of hail. Furthermore, the comparability of observing systems even within the same category (e.g., differently calibrated radar networks) represents an unresolved problem. Ground-truth observations through crowd-sourcing mobile applications (European Weather OBserver App, EWOB, Groenemeijer et al., 2017; MeteoSwiss App, Social Media) or drone-observations to detect the spatial pattern of areas affected by hail are valuable and low-cost. Such methods, however, also need to be complemented by standardized direct ground observations such as those from automatic hail sensors. Additionally, observations of properties such as drag coefficients of falling hailstones or freezing processes in laboratory experiments are needed to improve theoretical knowledge. Only this will allow further improving microphysical parametrizations of hail in NWP models.

Results presented from high frequency, high resolution radar assimilation into an ensemble numerical weather prediction system gave a glimpse of the enormous potential of this method for nowcasting applications.

Concerning the frequently asked question about the relation between hailstorm frequency/intensity and climate change, additional knowledge is necessary to better understand the link between large-scale natural climate variability and local-scale convection, including the drivers behind these links such as teleconnection patterns. First model analyses and (sparse) observations, with large uncertainty and variability, generally point to more intense hail storms in a warming climate, but also to enhanced melting of small hailstones.

Acknowledgements:

The Hail Workshop was supported by the Swiss Science Foundation and the Mobiliar Lab for Natural Risks.

References

Dotzek, N., Groenemeijer, P., Feuerstein, B. and Holzer A.M. Overview of ESSL's severe convective storms research using the European Severe Weather Database ESWD. *Atmos. Res.*, 2009, 93, 575–586, doi:[10.1016/j.atmosres.2008.10.020](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.atmosres.2008.10.020).

Groenemeijer, P., Púčik, T., Holzer A.M., Antonescu, B., Riemann-Campe, K., Schultz D.M., Kühne, T., Feuerstein, B., Brooks, H.E., Doswell III, C.A., Koppert, H.-J. and Sausen, R. Severe convective storms in Europe: Ten years of research at the European Severe Storms Laboratory. *Bull. Am. Meteorol. Soc.*, 2017, doi:10.1175/BAMS-D-16-0067.1.

Punge, H. J. and Kunz, M. Hail observations and hailstorm characteristics in Europe: A review. *Atmos. Res.*, 2016, 176, 159–184, doi:10.1016/j.atmosres.2016.02.012.